# The Resultant of the Cyclotomic Polynomials $F_{m}(a x)$ and $F_{n}(b x)$ 

By Tom M. Apostol


#### Abstract

The resultant $\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)$ is calculated for arbitrary positive integers $m$ and $n$, and arbitrary nonzero complex numbers $a$ and $b$. An addendum gives an extended bibliography of work on cyclotomic polynomials published since 1919.


1. Introduction. Let $F_{n}(x)$ denote the cyclotomic polynomial of degree $\varphi(n)$ given by

$$
F_{n}(x)=\prod_{k=1}^{n}\left(x-e^{2 \pi i k / n}\right)
$$

where the ' indicates that $k$ runs through integers relatively prime to the upper index $n$, and $\varphi(n)$ is Euler's totient. The resultant $\rho\left(F_{m}, F_{n}\right)$ of any two cyclotomic polynomials was first calculated by Emma Lehmer [9] in 1930 and later by Diederichsen [21] and the author [64]. It is known that $\rho\left(F_{m}, F_{n}\right)=1$ if $(m, n)=1, m>$ $n>1$. This implies that for any integer $q$ the integers $F_{m}(q)$ and $F_{n}(q)$ are relatively prime if $(m, n)=1$.

Divisibility properties of cyclotomic polynomials play a role in certain areas of the theory of numbers, such as the distribution of quadratic residues, difference sets, perfect numbers, Mersenne-type numbers, and primes in residue classes. There has also been considerable interest lately in relations between the integers $F_{p}(q)$ and $F_{q}(p)$, where $p$ and $q$ are distinct primes. In particular, Marshall Hall informs me that the Feit-Thompson proof [47] could be shortened by nearly 50 pages if it were known that $F_{p}(q)$ and $F_{q}(p)$ are relatively prime, or even if the smaller of these integers does not divide the larger. Recently, N. M. Stephens [69] has shown that when $p=17$ and $q=3313$, the prime $112643=2 p q+1$ divides both $F_{p}(q)$ and $F_{q}(p)$. These remarks suggest a study of relations connecting the polynomials $F_{p}(q x)$ and $F_{q}(p x)$. For example, if the resultant of $F_{p}(q x)$ and $F_{q}(p x)$ were equal to 1 it would follow that the integers $F_{p}(q)$ and $F_{q}(p)$ are relatively prime. In this note we use the method developed in [64] to calculate the resultant $\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)$ for arbitrary positive integers $m$ and $n$, and arbitrary nonzero complex numbers $a$ and $b$ (see Theorem 1). When $m$ and $n$ are distinct primes $p$ and $q$ the results of Theorem 1 simplify considerably to give the explicit formula

$$
\begin{align*}
\rho\left(F_{q}(a x), F_{p}(b x)\right) & =\frac{a^{p q}-b^{p q}}{a^{p}-b^{p}} \frac{a-b}{a^{q}-b^{q}} & \text { if } a \neq b, \\
& =a^{(p-1)(q-1)} & \text { if } a=b . \tag{1}
\end{align*}
$$

Unfortunately this formula sheds no light on the g.c.d of the integers $F_{q}(p)$ and $F_{p}(q)$.

An addendum to the paper gives an extended bibliography of work on cyclotomic polynomials published since 1919. The report by Dickson et al. in [1] contains a history of earlier work in this area.
2. A Product Formula for $\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)$. We assume throughout this section that $m$ and $n$ are integers $>1$ and that $a$ and $b$ are arbitrary nonzero complex numbers.

Theorem 1. We have
(2) $\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)=b^{\varphi(m) \varphi(n)} \prod_{d \mid n} F_{m / \delta}\left(\frac{a^{d}}{b^{d}}\right)^{\mu(n / d) \varphi(m) / \varphi(m / \delta)}$,
where $\delta=(m, d)$ for each divisor $d$ of $n$.
Proof. We use the notation and properties of $\rho(A, B)$ described in [64, pp. 457-458]. From the multiplicative property $\rho(A, B C)=\rho(A, B) \rho(A, C)$ and the factorization

$$
F_{n}(x)=\prod_{d \mid n}\left(x^{d}-1\right)^{\mu(n / d)}
$$

we find, as in [64, Section 4],

$$
\begin{equation*}
\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)=\prod_{d \mid n} f(d)^{\mu(n / d)} \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
f(d)=\rho\left(F_{m}(a x),(b x)^{d}-1\right)=\rho\left((b x)^{d}-1, F_{m}(a x)\right)
$$

since $\rho(A, B)=\rho(B, A)$ when $\operatorname{deg} A \operatorname{deg} B$ is even. Using Eq. (2.4) of [64], we have

$$
f(d)=a^{d \varphi(m)} \prod_{k=1}^{m}\left(\frac{b^{d}}{a^{d}} e^{2 \pi i k d / m}-1\right)=b^{d \varphi(m)} \prod_{k=1}^{m}\left(\frac{a^{d}}{b^{d}}-e^{2 \pi i k d / m}\right)
$$

In the last exponential we write

$$
\frac{k d}{m}=\frac{k d / \delta}{m / \delta}, \quad \text { where } \delta=(m, d),(m / \delta, d / \delta)=1
$$

and then use the Lemma on p. 457 of [64] to obtain

$$
\begin{aligned}
f(d) & =b^{d \varphi(m)} \prod_{k=1}^{m / \delta}\left(\frac{a^{d}}{b^{d}}-e^{2 \pi i k /(m / \delta)}\right)^{\varphi(m) / \varphi(m / \delta)} \\
& =b^{d \varphi(m)} F_{m / \delta}\left(\frac{a^{d}}{b^{d}}\right)^{\varphi(m) / \varphi(m / \delta)}
\end{aligned}
$$

Using this in (3) along with the relation $\Sigma_{d / n} d \mu(n / d)=\varphi(n)$, we obtain (2).
3. Special Cases of Theorem 1. If $(m, n)=1$, then $\delta=(m, d)=1$ for each divisor $d$ of $n$, and Theorem 1 simplifies as follows:

THEOREM 2. If $(m, n)=1$ we have

$$
\begin{equation*}
\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{n}(b x)\right)=b^{\varphi(m n)} \prod_{d \mid n} F_{m}\left(\frac{a^{d}}{b^{d}}\right)^{\mu(n / d)} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Next, we take $n=p^{\alpha}$ where $p$ is prime, $p \nmid m$, and $\alpha \geqslant 1$. Let $c=$ $a / b$. Then the product in (4) has only two factors with nonzero exponent, those corresponding to $d=p^{\alpha-1}$ and $d=p^{\alpha}$. Hence the product simplifies to $F_{m}\left(c^{p^{\alpha}}\right) / F_{m}\left(c^{p^{\alpha-1}}\right)$. But by Dickson's formula [1, p. 32]

$$
\begin{equation*}
F_{m}\left(x^{p^{\alpha}}\right) / F_{m}\left(x^{p^{\alpha-1}}\right)=F_{m p^{\alpha}}(x) \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

valid if $p \nmid m$, the last quotient simplifies to $F_{m p}(c)$. Therefore we have proved:
THEOREM 3. If $p$ is prime and $p \nmid m$, then for $a b \neq 0$ and each integer $\alpha \geqslant 1$ we have

$$
\rho\left(F_{m}(a x), F_{p^{\alpha}}(b x)\right)=b^{\varphi\left(m p^{\alpha}\right)} F_{m p^{\alpha}}(a / b)
$$

Finally, we take $\alpha=1$ and $m=q$, where $q$ is a prime $\neq p$, to obtain:
THEOREM 4. If $p$ and $q$ are distinct primes and $a b \neq 0$, we have

$$
\begin{equation*}
\rho\left(F_{q}(a x), F_{p}(b x)\right)=b^{(p-1)(q-1)} F_{p q}(a / b) \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Note. If $a=b$, then $F_{p q}(1)=1$ and $\rho\left(F_{q}(a x), F_{p}(a x)\right)=a^{(p-1)(q-1)}$. To calculate $F_{p q}(a / b)$ when $a \neq b$ it is preferable to use Dickson's formula (5) with $\alpha=1$ and $x=a / b$ to write

$$
F_{p q}(a / b)=F_{q}\left(x^{p}\right) / F_{q}(x)=\frac{x^{p q}-1}{x^{p}-1} \frac{x-1}{x^{q}-1}
$$

Using this in (6) we obtain the explicit formula (1) referred to in the introduction.

Addendum. Bibliography on Cyclotomic Polynomials. This bibliography updates the list of references on cyclotomic polynomials which appears in Chapter II of the report by Dickson et al. in [1], and fills a gap (entry [2]). The titles, which are listed chronologically, were obtained from Fortschritte der Mathematik, Zentralblatt für Mathematik, and Mathematical Reviews. References to these review jornals are indicated by F, Z, or MR, respectively. Except for Storer's
book [55], works on cyclotomy and cyclotomic fields are not listed. Several textbooks on Algebra and Number Theory discuss cyclotomic polynomials, for example, N. Tschebotaröw and H. Schwerdtfeger, Grundzüge der Galois'schen Theorie, P. Noordhoff, Groningen, 1950; Trygve Nagell, Introduction to Number Theory, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1951; Hans Rademacher, Lectures on Elementary Number Theory, Blaisdell, New York, 1964.

Mathematics Department
California Institute of Technology
Pasadena, California 91125

1. L. E. DICKSON, H. H. MITCHELL, H. S. VANDIVER \& G. E. WAHLIN, Algebraic Numbers, Bulletin of the National Research Council, vol. 5, part 3, \#28, National Academy of Sciences, 1923.
2. J. PETERSEN, On the Sum of Quadratic Residues and the Distribution of Prime Numbers of the form $4 n+3$, Anniversary Volume, University of Copenhagen, 1907. (Danish)
3. E. JACOBSTHAL, "Fibonaccische Polynome und Kreisteilungsgleichungen," Sitzungsber. Ber. Math. Ges., v. 17, 1919/20, pp. 43-51. [F 47, p. 109.]
4. P. O. UPADHYAYA, "A general theorem for the representation of $X$, where $X$ represents the polynomial $\left(x^{p}-1\right) /(x-1), "$ Calcutta Math. Soc. Bull., v. 14, 1923, pp. $41-$ 54. [F 49, p. 51.]
5. K. GRANDJOT, "Über die Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Math. Z., v. 19, 1924, pp. 128-129. [F 49, p. 51.]
6. H. SPATH, "Über die Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Math. Z., v. 26, 1926, p. 442. [F 53, p. 999.]
7. E. LANDAU, "Über die Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Math. Z., v. 29, 1929, p. 462. [F 54, p. 123.]
8. I. SCHUR, "Zur Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Math. Z., v. 29, 1929, p. 463. [F 54, p. 123.]
9. EMMA LEHMER, "A numerical function applied to cyclotomy," Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 36, 1930, pp. 291-298. [F 56, p. 861.]
10. FRIEDRICH HARTMANN, "Miszellen zur Primzahltheorie. I," Jber. Deutsch. Math.-Verein., v. 40, 1931, pp. 228-232. [F 57, p. 185.]
11. FRIEDRICH HARTMANN, "Miszellen zur Primzahltheorie. II," Jber. Deutsch. Math.-Verein., v. 42, 1932, pp. 135-141. [Z 6, p. 10.]
$1 \rightarrow$ D. H. LEHMER, "Quasi-cyclotomic polynomials," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 39, 1932, pp. 383-389. [Z 5, p. 193.]
$1 \rightarrow$ D. H. LEHMER, "Factorization of certain cyclotomic functions," Ann. of Math. (2), v. 34, 1933, pp. 461-479. [Z 7, p. 199.]
12. JOSEF PLEMELJ, "Die Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Publ. Math. Univ. Belgrade, v. 2, 1933, pp. 164-165. [Z 8, p. 388.]
13. ROLF BUNGERS, Über die Koeffizienten von Kreisteilungspolynomen, Dissertation, Göttingen, 1934, 15 S . [Z 9, p. 102.]
14. FRIEDRICH LEVI, "Zur Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungspolynome," Compositio

Math., v. 1, 1934, pp. 303-304. [Z 9, p. 100.]
17. EMMA LEHMER, "On the magnitude of the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 42, 1936, pp. 389-392. [Z 14, p. 392.]
18. O. HÖLDER, "Zur Theorie der Kreisteilungsgleichung $K_{m}(x)=0$," Prace Mat. Fiz., v. 43, 1936, pp. 13-23. [Z 13, p. 5.]
19. HEINRICH TOEPKEN, "Zur Irreduzibilität der Kreisteilungsgleichung," Deutsche Math., v. 2, 1937, pp. 631-633. [Z 18, p. 99.]
20. J. E. EATON, "A formula for the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 45, 1939, pp. 178-186. [Z 20, p. 289.]
21. FRITZ-ERDMANN DIEDERICHSEN, "Über die Ausreduktion ganzzahliger Gruppendarstellungen bei arithmetischer Äquivalenz," Abh. Math. Sem. Hanisches Univ., v. 13 , 1940, pp. 357-412. [Z 23, p. 13.]
22. HANS-JOACHIM KANOLD, "Untersuchungen über ungerade vollkommene Zahlen J. Reine Angew. Math., v. 183, 1941, pp. 98-109. [MR 3, p. 268.]
23. T. VIJAYARAGHAVAN \& S. CHOWLA, "The complete factorization ( $\bmod p$ ) of the cyclotomic polynomial of order $p^{2}-1, "$ Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. India Sect. A, v. 14, 1944, pp. 101-105. [MR 7, p. 273.]
24. PAUL ERDÖS, "On the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 52, 1946, pp. 179-184. [MR 7, p. 242.]
25. HANS-JOACHIM KANOLD, "Kreisteilungspolynome und ungerade vollkommene Zahlen," Ber. Math.-Tagung Tübingen, v. 1946, pp. 84-87. [MR 9, p. 78.]
26. P. T. BATEMAN, "Note on the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 55, 1949, pp. 1180-1181. [MR 11, p. 329.]
27. W. KLOBE, "Über eine untere Abschätzung der $n$-ten Kreisteilungspolynome $g_{n}(z)=\Pi_{d \mid n}\left(z^{d}-1\right)^{\mu(n / d)}, " J$. Reine Angew. Math., v. 187, 1949, pp. 68-69. [MR 11, p. 417.]
28. PAUL ERDÖS, "On the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Portugal. Math., v. 8, 1949, pp. 63-71. [MR 12, p. 11.]
29. HANS-JOACHIM KANOLD, "Sätze über Kreisteilungspolynome und ihre Anwendungen auf einige zahlentheoretische Probleme. I," J. Reine Angew. Math., v. 187, 1950, pp. 169-182. [MR 12, p. 592.]
30. HANS-JOACHIM KANOLD, "Sätze über Kreisteilungspolynome und ihre Anwendungen auf einige zahlentheoretische Probleme. II," J. Reine Angew. Math., v. 188, 1950, pp. 129-146. [MR 13, p. 443.]
31. L. REDÉI, "Ein Beitrag zum Problem der Faktorisation von endlichen Abelschen Gruppen," Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar., v. 1, 1950, pp. 197-207. [MR 13, p. 623.]
32. N. G. W. H. BEEGER, "On a new quadratic form for certain cyclotomic polynomial," Nieuw Arch. Wisk., v. 23, 1951, pp. 249-252. [MR 13, p. 211.]
33. HANS-JOACHIM KANOLD, "Abschätzungen bei Kreisteilungspolynomen und daraus hergeleitete Bedingungen für die kleinsten Primzahlen gewisser arithmetischer Folgen," Math. Z., v. 55, 1952, pp. 284-287. [MR 14, p. 728.]
34. N. G. DeBRUIJN, "On the factorization of finite abelian groups," Nederl. A kad. Wetensch. Proc. Ser. A, v. 56 = Indag. Math., v. 15, 1953, pp. 370-377. [MR 15, p. 503.]
$3 \rightarrow$ L. CARLIT Z, "Note on the cy clotomic polynomial," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 61 1954, pp. 106-108. [MR 15, p. 508.]
36. LADISLAUS RÉDEI, "Über das Kreisteilungspolynom," Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar., v. 5, 1954, pp. 27-28. [MR 16, p. 13.]
$\Xi \rightarrow$ MORGAN WARD, "Cyclotomy and the converse of Fermat's theorem," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 61, 1954, p. 564. [MR 16, p. 115.]
38. ROBERT BALLIEU, "Factorisation des polynomes cyclotomiques modulo un nombre premier,"Ann. Soc. Sci. Bruxelles Sér. I, v. 68, 1954, pp. 140-144. [MR 16, p. 570.]
39. HANS PETERSSON, "Über eine Zerlegung des Kreisteilungspolynoms von Primzahlordnung," Math. Nachr., v. 14, 1955, pp. 361-375. [MR 18, p. 867.]
40. PAUL ERDÖS, "On the growth of the cyclotomic polynomial in the interval (0, 1)," Proc. Glasgow Math. Assoc., v. 3, 1957, pp. 102-104. [MR 19, p. 1039.]
41. J. VAN DE VOOREN-VAN VEEN, "On the number of irreducible equations of degree $n$ in $\operatorname{GF}(p)$ and the decomposability of the cyclotomic polynomials in $\mathrm{GF}(p)$," Simon Stevin, v. 31, 1957, pp. 80-82. (Dutch) [MR 18, p. 787.]
42. ERNST JACOBSTHAL, "Zur Theorie der Einheitswurzeln. I," Norske Vid. Selsk. Forh., v. 31, 1958, pp. 125-129. [MR 23 \#A1583.]
43. ERNST JACOBSTHAL, "Zur Theorie der Einheitswurzeln. II," Norske Vid. Selsk. Forh., v. 31, 1958, pp. 130-137. [MR 23 \#A1584.]
44. MORGAN WARD, "Tests for primality based on Sylvester's cyclotomic numbers," Pacific J. Math., v. 9, 1959, pp. 1269-1272. [MR 21 \#7180.]
45. L. K. DURST, "The growth of Sylvester's cyclotomic numbers," Duke Math. J., v. 29, 1962, pp. 447-454. [MR 25 \#3889.]
$4 \rightarrow$ L. MIRSKY, "A note on cyclotomic polynomials," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 69, 1962, pp. 772-775. [MR 27 \#2473.]
47. WALTER FEIT \& JOHN G. THOMPSON, "Solvability of groups of odd order," Pacific J. Math., v. 13, 1963, pp. 775-1029. [MR 29 \#3538.]
$4 \rightarrow$ SISTER MARION BEITER, "The midterm coefficient of the cyclotomic polynomial $F_{p q}(x), "$ Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 71, 1964, pp. 769-770. [Z 125, p. 8.]
49. HELEN HABERMEHL, SHARON RICHARDSON \& MARY ANN SZWAJKOS, "A note on coefficients of cyclotomic polynomials," Math. Mag., v. 37, 1964, pp. 183-185. [Z 122, p. 254.]
50. I. J. SCHOENBERG, "A note on the cyclotomic polynomial," Mathematika, v. 11, 1964, pp. 131-136. [MR 30 \#1122.]
51. HENRY B. MANN, "On linear relations between roots of unity," Mathematika, v. 12, 1965, pp. 107-117. [MR 33 \#119.]
52. K. E. KLOSS, "Some number-theoretic calculations," J. Res. Nat. Bur. Standards Sect. B, v. 69B, 1965, pp. 335-336. [MR 32 \#7473.]
$5 \rightarrow$ L. CARLITZ, "The number of terms in the cyclotomic polynomial $F_{p q}(x)$,"
Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 73, 1966, pp. 979-981. [MR 34 \#2517.]
54. D. H. LEHMER, "Some properties of the cyclotomic polynomial," J. Math. A nal. Appl., v. 15, 1966, pp. 105-117. [MR 33 \#5606.]
55. THOMAS STORER, Cyclotomy and Difference Sets, Markham, Chicago, Ill., 1967. [MR 36 \#128.]
56. L. CARLITZ, "The sum of the squares of the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial," Acta Math. Acad. Sci Hungar., v. 18, 1967, pp. 295-302. [MR 36 \#1 39.]
$5 \rightarrow$ SISTER MARION BEITER, "Magnitude of the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomial $F_{p q r}(x), "$ Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 75, 1968, pp. 370-372. [MR 37 \#2670.]
$5 \rightarrow$ D. M. BLOOM, "On the coefficients of the cyclotomic polynomials," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 75, 1968, pp. 372-377. [MR 37 \#2671.]
59. KAU-UN LU, Some Properties of the Coefficients of Cyclotomic Polynomials, Ph. D. Thesis, California Institute of Technology, 1968.
$\epsilon \rightarrow$ DAVID ZEITLIN, "On coefficient identities for cyclotomic polynomials $F_{p q}(x)$," Amer. Math. Monthly, v. 75, 1968, pp. 976-980. [MR 38 \#4446.]
61. VOLKMAR FELSCH \& ECKART SCHMIDT, "Über Perioden in den Koeffizienten der Kreisteilungspolynome $F_{n p}(x)$," Math. Z., v. 106, 1968, pp. 267-272. [MR 38 \#1080.]
62. JACQUES JUSTIN, "Bornes des coefficients du polynôme cyclotomique et de certains autres polynômes," C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Sér. A, v. 268, 1969, pp. A995-A997. [MR 39 \#2692.]
63. HERBERT MÖLLER, "Über die $i$-ten Koeffizienten der Kreisteilungspoly nome," Math. Ann., v. 188, 1970, pp. 26-38. [MR 42 \#1801.]
64. TOM M. APOSTOL, "Resultants of cyclotomic polynomials," Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., v. 24, 1970, pp. 457-462. [MR 40 \#4241.]
65. WAYNE L. McDANIEL, "The nonexistence of odd perfect numbers of a certain form," Arch. Math. (Basel), v. 21, 1970, pp. 52-53. [MR 41 \#3369.]
66. HERBERT MÖLLER, "Über die Koeffizienten des $n$-ten Kreisteilungspolynoms," Math. Z., v. 119, 1971, pp. 33-40. [MR 43 \#148.]
67. MARION BEITER, "Magnitude of the coefficients of the cy clotomic polynomial $F_{p q r}$. II," Duke Math. J., v. 38, 1971, pp. 591-594. [MR 43 \#6152.]
68. SISTER CHRISTELLE THEUSCH, "Composition of $\Phi_{3}(X)$ modulo m," Fibonacci Quart., v. 9, 1971, pp. 23-27. [MR 44 \#1623.]
69. N. M. STEPHENS, "On the Feit-Thompson conjecture," Math. Comp., v. 25, 1971, p. 625. [MR 45 \#6738.]
70. BERND RICHTER, "Die Primfaktorzerlegung der Werte der Kreisteilungspolynome," J. Reine Angew. Math., v. 254, 1972, pp. 123-132. [MR 46 \#1764.]
71. WAYNE L. McDANIEL, "On multiple prime divisors of cyclotomic polynomials," Math. Comp., v. 28, 1974, pp. 847-850.

Added in proof. For further papers on cyclotomic polynomials, see
WILLIAM J. LeVEQUE, Reviews in Number Theory, Vol. 1, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, R. I., 1974, pp. 404-411.

